In the Matter of the Petition

of

ALBERT ROSENBLOOM

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

State of New York County of Albany

John Huhn, being duly sworn, deposes and says that the is an employee of the Department of Taxation and Finance, over 18 years of age, and that on the 24th day of January , 1979 , the served the within Notice of Decision by (certified) mail upon Albert Rosenbloom

(******************************

by enclosing a true copy thereof in a securely sealed postpaid wrapper addressed as follows:

Albert Posephloom

Albert Rosenbloom 162-41 Powell Cove Boulevard Whitestone, NY

and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a (post office or official depository) under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

John Huhn

Sworn to before me this

24th day of January , 1979.

TA-3 (2/76)

In the Matter of the Petition

of

ALBERT ROSENBLOOM

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

State of New York County of Albany

John Huhn , being duly sworn, deposes and says that

Whe is an employee of the Department of Taxation and Finance, over 18 years of
age, and that on the 24th day of January , 1979 , Whe served the within

Notice of Decision by (certified) mail upon Jerome Brickman, P.A.

(representative of) the petitioner in the within proceeding, by enclosing a true copy thereof in a securely sealed postpaid wrapper addressed

as follows:

Jerome Brickman

c/o Scher & Brickman 110 West 51st Street New York, NY 10020

and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a (post office or official depository) under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

That deponent further says that the said addressee is the (representative of the) petitioner herein and that the address set forth on said wrapper is the last known address of the (representative of the) petitioner.

John Hihn

Sworn to before me this

24th day of January

1979

TA-3 (2/76)



STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION TAX APPEALS BUREAU ALBANY, NEW YORK 12227

January 24, 1979

Albert Rosenbloom 162-41 Powell Cove Boulevard Whitestone, NY

Dear Mr. Rosenbloom:

Please take notice of the **Notice of Decision** of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

You have now exhausted your right of review at the administrative level. Pursuant to section() 722 of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review an adverse decision by the State Tax Commission can only be instituted under Article 78 of the Civil Practice Laws and Rules, and must be commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, Albany County, within four menths from the date of this notice.

Inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision may be addressed to the Deputy Commissioner and Counsel to the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, Albany, New York 12227. Said inquiries will be referred to the proper authority for reply.

Sincerely,

Joseph Chyrywaty Hearing Examiner

cc: Petitioner's Representative

Taxing Bureau's Representative

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

ALBERT ROSENBLOOM

DECISION

for Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Unincorporated Business Tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the Years 1969, 1970 and 1971.

Petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, 162-41 Powell Cove Boulevard, Whitestone, New York, filed a petition for redetermination of a deficiency or for refund of unincorporated business tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the years 1969, 1970 and 1971 (File No. 11859).

A small claims hearing was held before Harry Huebsch, Hearing Officer, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, Two World Trade Center, New York, New York, on November 14, 1977 at 2:45 P.M. Petitioner appeared by Jerome Brickman, P.A. The Income Tax Bureau appeared by Peter Crotty, Esq. (Irwin Levy, Esq., of counsel).

ISSUE

Whether the income derived from petitioner's activities as a salesman during 1969, 1970 and 1971 was subject to unincorporated business tax.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, filed New York State personal income tax returns for 1969, 1970 and 1971. He did not file unincorporated business tax returns for said years.
- 2. The Income Tax Bureau contended that petitioner's selling activities during the years at issue constituted the carrying on of an unincorporated business. Accordingly, it issued a Notice of Deficiency for 1969 on January 26, 1976 in the amount of \$1,255.76 in unincorporated business tax, plus \$596.49 in penalty and \$435.50 in interest, for a total of \$2,287.75. It also issued a Notice of Deficiency for 1970 and 1971 on November 24, 1975 in the amount of \$3,504.73 in unincorporated business tax, plus \$2,428.48 in penalty and \$1,102.61 in interest, for a total of \$7,035.82.
- 3. During the years at issue, petitioner was employed as a sales manager by Tropical Fish Hobbies Publications, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as "TFH") and its two subsidiaries, Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. He was to act in said capacity for the three entities, since all of them were in the tropical fish accessories business. The President of TFH hired petitioner because of his expertise in this area. Petitioner's duties included opening new accounts and supervising the activities

of nine salesmen on behalf of the three corporations. He was supplied with an office and a secretary at the premises of Bader Industries, Inc. in Pinebrook, New Jersey. He was also given office space and the use of facilities on the business premises of TFH in Jersey City, New Jersey, which was also the location of Miracle Pet Products, Inc.

- 4. Petitioner was paid a weekly salary by each of the three corporations and was issued withholding tax statements. Income taxes and social security were withheld from his compensation. He was covered by workmen's compensation and received paid vacations. Petitioner performed his duties under the control and direction of the President of TFH. Petitioner did not maintain an office of his own, nor did he finance his own pension plan or have his own letterheads and business cards.
- 5. In 1969 petitioner introduced the entire lines of the three corporations to a very large account, namely, Two Guys
 Department Stores (hereinafter referred to as "Two Guys"). Two
 Guys required a complete tropical fish line and requested that tropical fish (as well as all tanks and accessories) be supplied.
 With the consent and encouragement of the President of TFH, petitioner arranged for the tropical fish to be provided to Two Guys by
 George Noble, a fish wholesaler. Thereafter, petitioner was regularly paid commissions by George Noble and, with the consent of TFH, provided services for George Noble which required a relatively small amount of petitioner's time.

manner by George Noble. He filed Federal Schedule "C" to report the commissions earned and to claim deductions against this income. For New York State personal income tax purposes, petitioner reported his compensation from TFH, Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. as wages, and his commission income from George Noble as business income. Petitioner's net business income derived from his activities on behalf of George Noble was \$15,324.96 in 1969, \$18,310.33 in 1970 and \$24,349.71 in 1971.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- A. That petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, performed services as an employee for Tropical Fish Hobbies Publications, Inc., Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. and that the income derived therefrom during 1969, 1970 and 1971 was not subject to unincorporated business tax, in accordance with the meaning and intent of section 703(b) of the Tax Law.
- B. That the activities of petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, on behalf of George Noble during 1969, 1970 and 1971, constituted the carrying on of an unincorporated business; thus, the net income derived therefrom of \$15,324.96 in 1969, \$18,310.33 in 1970 and \$24,349.71 in 1971 was subject to unincorporated business tax, in accordance with the meaning and intent of section 703 of the Tax Law.

C. That the petition of Albert Rosenbloom is granted to the extent shown in Conclusions of Law "A" and "B", above. The Income Tax Bureau is hereby directed to so modify the notices of deficiency issued January 26, 1976 and November 24, 1975 and that, except as so granted, the petition is in all other respects denied.

DATED: Albany, New York
January 24, 1979

STATE TAX COMMISSION

RESIDENT

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER



JAMES H. TULLY JR., PRESIDENT MILTON KOERNER THOMAS H. LYNCH

STATE QF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION TAX APPEALS BUREAU ALBANY, NEW YORK 12227

January 24, 1979

Albert Rosenbloom 162-41 Powell Cove Boulevard Whitestone, NY

Dear Mr. Rosenbloom:

Please take notice of the Notice of Decision of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

You have now exhausted your right of review at the administrative level. Pursuant to section(x) 722 of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review an adverse decision by the State Tax Commission can only be instituted under Article 78 of the Civil Practice Laws and Rules, and must be commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, Albany County, within four months from the date of this notice.

Inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision may be addressed to the Deputy Commissioner and Counsel to the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, Albany, New York 12227. Said inquiries will be referred to the proper authority for reply.

Sincerely,

Joseph Chyrywaty

Hearing Examiner

cc: Petitioner's Representative

Taxing Bureau's Representative

LWAYS USE ZIP CODE Albert Rosenbloom 162441 Powell Cove Boulevard Mitestone, NY No such street ___ number Addressee unknown_ Insufficient Address ... Department of Taxation and Finance TAX APPEALS BUREAU STATE OF NEW YORK ALBANY, N. Y. 12227 STATE CAMPUS SMAIL CLAIMS TA-26 (4-76) 25M



STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

ALBERT ROSENBLOOM

DECISION

for Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Unincorporated Business Tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the Years 1969, 1970 and 1971.

Petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, 162-41 Powell Cove Boulevard, Whitestone, New York, filed a petition for redetermination of a deficiency or for refund of unincorporated business tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the years 1969, 1970 and 1971 (File No. 11859).

A small claims hearing was held before Harry Huebsch, Hearing Officer, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, Two World Trade Center, New York, New York, on November 14, 1977 at 2:45 P.M. Petitioner appeared by Jerome Brickman, P.A. The Income Tax Bureau appeared by Peter Crotty, Esq. (Irwin Levy, Esq., of counsel).

ISSUE

Whether the income derived from petitioner's activities as a salesman during 1969, 1970 and 1971 was subject to unincorporated business tax.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, filed New York State personal income tax returns for 1969, 1970 and 1971. He did not file unincorporated business tax returns for said years.
- 2. The Income Tax Bureau contended that petitioner's selling activities during the years at issue constituted the carrying on of an unincorporated business. Accordingly, it issued a Notice of Deficiency for 1969 on January 26, 1976 in the amount of \$1,255.76 in unincorporated business tax, plus \$596.49 in penalty and \$435.50 in interest, for a total of \$2,287.75. It also issued a Notice of Deficiency for 1970 and 1971 on November 24, 1975 in the amount of \$3,504.73 in unincorporated business tax, plus \$2,428.48 in penalty and \$1,102.61 in interest, for a total of \$7,035.82.
- 3. During the years at issue, petitioner was employed as a sales manager by Tropical Fish Hobbies Publications, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as "TFH") and its two subsidiaries, Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. He was to act in said capacity for the three entities, since all of them were in the tropical fish accessories business. The President of TFH hired petitioner because of his expertise in this area. Petitioner's duties included opening new accounts and supervising the activities

of nine salesmen on behalf of the three corporations. He was supplied with an office and a secretary at the premises of Bader Industries, Inc. in Pinebrook, New Jersey. He was also given office space and the use of facilities on the business premises of TFH in Jersey City, New Jersey, which was also the location of Miracle Pet Products, Inc.

- 4. Petitioner was paid a weekly salary by each of the three corporations and was issued withholding tax statements. Income taxes and social security were withheld from his compensation. He was covered by workmen's compensation and received paid vacations. Petitioner performed his duties under the control and direction of the President of TFH. Petitioner did not maintain an office of his own, nor did he finance his own pension plan or have his own letterheads and business cards.
- three corporations to a very large account, namely, Two Guys
 Department Stores (hereinafter referred to as "Two Guys"). Two
 Guys required a complete tropical fish line and requested that
 tropical fish, (as well as all tanks and accessories) be supplied.
 With the consent and encouragement of the President of TFH, petitioner
 arranged for the tropical fish to be provided to Two Guys by
 George Noble, a fish wholesaler. Thereafter, petitioner was
 regularly paid commissions by George Noble and, with the consent
 of TFH, provided services for George Noble which required a relatively
 small amount of petitioner's time.

6. Petitioner was not controlled and directed in any manner by George Noble. He filed Federal Schedule "C" to report the commissions earned and to claim deductions against this income. For New York State personal income tax purposes, petitioner reported his compensation from TFH, Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. as wages, and his commission income from George Noble as business income. Petitioner's net business income derived from his activities on behalf of George Noble was \$15,324.96 in 1969, \$18,310.33 in 1970 and \$24,349.71 in 1971.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- A. That petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, performed services as an employee for Tropical Fish Hobbies Publications, Inc., Bader Industries, Inc. and Miracle Pet Products, Inc. and that the income derived therefrom during 1969, 1970 and 1971 was not subject to unincorporated business tax, in accordance with the meaning and intent of section 703(b) of the Tax Law.
- B. That the activities of petitioner, Albert Rosenbloom, on behalf of George Noble during 1969, 1970 and 1971, constituted the carrying on of an unincorporated business; thus, the net income derived therefrom of \$15,324.96 in 1969, \$18,310.33 in 1970 and \$24,349.71 in 1971 was subject to unincorporated business tax, in accordance with the meaning and intent of section 703 of the Tax Law.

C. That the petition of Albert Rosenbloom is granted to the extent shown in Conclusions of Law "A" and "B", above. The Income Tax Bureau is hereby directed to so modify the notices of deficiency issued January 26, 1976 and November 24, 1975 and that, except as so granted, the petition is in all other respects denied.

DATED: Albany, New York

January 24, 1979

STATE TAX COMMISSION

PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER