

Unincorp. Bus. Tax
BUREAU OF LAW Determinations A-Z
MEMORANDUM

Spilka, Sydney

TO: Commissioners Murphy, Macduff and Conlon
FROM: Francis V. Dow, Hearing Officer
SUBJECT: SPILKA, SYDNEY

Application for revision or refund
of unincorporated business taxes
under Article 23 of the Tax Law for
the year 1960

A hearing with reference to the above matter was held before me at 60 Centre Street, New York, New York on October 9, 1966. The appearances and the exhibits produced were as shown in the stenographic minutes submitted herewith.

The taxpayer filed unincorporated business and personal income tax returns in which he reported net income of \$9,709.03 from his business as a builder and \$17,000.00 for building fees received for supervising the construction of a seven-story apartment building. He claimed that the \$17,000.00 which he received for building fees was not subject to unincorporated business tax, and did not include it in his unincorporated business tax return.

An assessment was issued for 1960 on August 2, 1962 (Assessment No. AB016246) which assessed additional unincorporated business tax due in the amount of \$769.68 on the basis that the building fees in the amount of \$17,000.00 were an integral part of the taxpayer's operations as a builder and subject to the unincorporated business tax.

In 1949 the taxpayer entered into the business of building one and two-family houses on his own account. All construction work was contracted for except general cleaning of the construction sites and the job of watchman. These jobs were performed by the taxpayer's employees.

In 1959 the taxpayer organized the S.H.C. Building Corp. and became owner of 25 percent of its stock and its president. He entered into an agreement during that year with the other stockholders of the corporation to supervise the construction of a seven-story apartment house for the corporation. All construction work was subcontracted except that of a watchman and some labor which was done by the corporation's employees. The apartment building was completed in 1960. At the time that the taxpayer

-8-

entered into the supervision of the construction of the apartment building, the amount that he was to receive for his services was indefinite. The taxpayer was not subject to any supervision and control of his activities. He was paid \$17,000.00 for these services. Payments were not made to him on a regular basis but were made as he required them. The taxpayer was not listed on the books of the corporation as an employee. No income taxes or social security taxes were withheld from the payments made to him. The taxpayer however was covered by workmen's compensation insurance under a policy obtained by the corporation. He received no salary as an officer of the corporation. Upon completion of the apartment house the taxpayer again continued his business of building one and two-family houses which he had discontinued during the construction of the apartment house.

The entire facts herein disclose that the \$17,000.00 received by the taxpayer for building fees was received as an independent contractor and not as an employee, despite the fact that the taxpayer was covered by workmen's compensation insurance. Accordingly, his activities in the supervision of the construction of the apartment building constituted the carrying on of an unincorporated business.

For the reasons stated above, I recommend that the determination of the State Tax Commission denying the taxpayer's petition in the above matter be substantially in the form submitted herewith.

Very truly yours, *[Signature]* FRANCIS V. DOW, Esquire, Atty.

RECORDED AND INDEXED IN THE RECORDS OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION
AT BOSTON, MASS., ON JUNE 27, 1967.
[Signature] /s/ FRANCIS V. DOW, Esquire, Atty.

June 27, 1967

FWD:lb
Enc. *[Signature]*

7-6-67

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

324

325

326

327

328

329

330

331

332

333

334

335

336

337

338

339

340

341

342

343

344

345

346

347

348

349

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

403

404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

424

425

426

427

428

429

430

431

432

433

434

435

436

437

438

439

440

441

442

443

444

445

446

447

448

449

450

451

452

453

454

455

456

457

458

459

460

461

462

463

464

465

466

467

468

469

470

471

472

473

474

475

476

477

478

479

480

481

482

483

484

485

486

487

488

489

490

491

492

493

494

495

496

497

498

499

500

501

502

503

504

505

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

516

517

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536

537

538

539

540

541

542

543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

551

552

553

554

555

556

557

558

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

566

567

568

569

570

571

572

573

574

575

576

577

578

579

580

581

582

583

584

585

586

587

588

589

590

591

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

600

601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

621

622

623

624

625

626

627

628

629

630

631

632

633

634

635

636

637

638

639

640

641

642

643

644

645

646

647

648

649

650

651

652

653

654

655

656

657

658

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

666

667

668

669

660

661

662

663

664

665

666

667

668

669

670

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686

687

688

689

690

691

692

693

694

695

696

697

698

699

700

701

702

703

704

705

706

707

708

709

710

711

712

713

714

715

716

717

718

719

720

721

722

723

724

725

726

727

728

729

720

721

722

723

724

725

726

727

728

729

730

731

732

733

734

735

736

737

738

739

730

731

732

733

734

735

736

737

738

739

740

741

742

743

744

745

746

747

748

749

740

741

742

743

744

745

746

747

748

749

750

751

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

750

751

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

778

779

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

778

779

780

781

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

780

781

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791

792

793

794

795

796

797

798

799

790

791

792

793

794

795

796

797

798

799

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

807

808

809

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

807

808

809

810

811

812

813

814

815

816

817

818

819

810

811

812

813

814

815

816

817

818

819

820

821

822

823

824

825

826

827

828

829

820

821

822

823

824

825

826

827

828

829

830

831

832

833

834

835

836

837

838

839

830

831

832

833

834

835

836

837

838

839

840

841

842

843

844

845

846

847

848

849

840

841

842

843

844

845

846

847

848

849

850

851

852

853

854

855

856

857

858

859

850

851

852

853

854

855

856

857

858

859

860

861

862

863

864

865

866

867

868

869

860

861

862

863

864

865

866

867

868

869

870

871

872

873

874

875

876

877

878

879

870

871

872

873

874

875

876

877

878

879

880

881

882

883

884

885

886

887

888

889

880

881

882

883

884

885

886

887

888

889

890

891

892

893

894

895

896

897

898

899

890

891

892

893

894

895

896

897

898

899

900

901

902

903

904

905

906

907

908

909

900

901

902

903

904

905

906

907

908

909

910

911

912

913

914

915

916

917

918

919

910

911

912

913

914

915

916

917

918

919

920

921

922

923

924

925

926

927

928

929

920

921

922

923

924

925

926

927

928

929

930

931

932

933

934

935

936

937

938

939

930

931

932

933

934

935

936

937

938

939

940

941

942

943

944

945

946

947

948

949

940

941

942

943

944

945

946

947

948

949

950

951

952

953

954

955

956

957

958

959

950

951

952

953

954

955

956

957

958

959

960

961

962

963

964

965

966

967

968

969

960

961

962

963

964

965

966

967

968

969

970

971

972

973

974

975

976

977

978

979

970

971

972

973

974

975

976

977

978

979

980

981

982

983

984

985

986

987

988

989

980

981

982

983

984

985

986

987

988

989

990

991

992

993

994

995

996

997

998

999

990

991

992

993

994

995

996

997

998

999

1000

1001

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006

1007

1008

1009

1000

1001

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006

1007

1008

1009

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023

1024

1025

1026

1027

1028

1029

1020

1021

1022

1023

1024

1025

1026

1027

1028

1029

1030

1031

1032

1033

1034

1035

1036

1037

1038

1039

1030

1031

1032

1033

1034

1035

1036

1037

1038

1039

1040

1041

1042

1043

1044

1045

1046

1047

1048

1049

1040

1041

1042

1043

1044

1045

1046

1047

1048

1049

1050

1051

1052

1053

1054

1055

1056

1057

1058

1059

1050

1051

1052

1053

1054

1055

1056

1057

1058

1059

1060

1061

1062

1063

1064

1065

1066

1067

1068

1069

1060

1061

1062

1063

1064

1065

1066

1067

1068

1069

1070

1071

1072

1073

1074

1075

1076

1077

1078

1079

1070

1071

1072

1073

1074

1075

1076

1077

1078

1079

1080

1081

1082

1083

1084

1085

1086

1087

1088

1089

1080

1081

1082

1083

1084

1085

1086

1087

1088

1089

1090

1091

1092

1093

1094

1095

1096

1097

1098

1099

1090

1091

1092

1093

1094

1095

1096

1097

1098

1099

1100

1101

1102

1103

1104

1105

1106

1107

1108

1109

1100

1101

1102

1103

1104

1105

1106

1107

1108

1109

1110

1111

1112

<p

STATE OF NEW YORK
STATE TAX COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION

OF

FRANCIS V. DOW

FOR REVIEW OR REVISED OF UNINCORPORATED
BUSINESS TAXES WHICH APPLIED TO THE
TAX LAW FOR THE YEAR 1950

The taxpayer herein having filed an application for review or refund of unincorporated business taxes under Article 83 of the Tax Law for the year 1950 and a hearing having been held in connection therewith before Francis V. Dow, Hearing Officer of the Department of taxation and Finance at the office of the State Tax Commission, 60 Centre Street, New York, New York at which hearing the taxpayer testified and was represented and the record having been duly examined and considered,

The State Tax Commission hereby finds:

- (1) That the taxpayer filed unincorporated business and personal income tax returns for the year 1950 in which he reported net income of \$9,785.03 from his business as a builder, and \$17,000 for building fees; that the taxpayer did not include the \$17,000 received as building fees as business income in his unincorporated business tax return.
- (2) That an assessment was issued for 1950 on August 6, 1951 (Assessment No. A8015046) assessing additional unincorporated business tax due in the amount of \$769.68 on the basis that building fees in the amount of \$17,000 were an integral part of the taxpayer's operation as a builder and subject to the unincorporated business tax.
- (3) That prior to 1950 the taxpayer was a builder of one and two-family houses on his own account; that in his business as a builder the taxpayer subcontracted all work except that of a

-2-

watchmen and labor to do general cleaning of construction sites which was done by employees of the taxpayer; that in 1959 the taxpayer organized the S.E.S. Building Corp. and became its president and the owner of 25 percent of its stock; that the taxpayer received no salary as an officer of the corporation.

(4) That the taxpayer entered into an agreement with the other stockholders of the corporation whereby the taxpayer agreed to supervise the construction of a seven-story apartment house for the corporation; that no definite agreement was made with the stockholders of the corporation for the compensation of the taxpayer for his supervisory services; that there was no supervision and control of the taxpayer's activities; that the taxpayer was paid \$17,000 for his services in supervising the construction of the apartment building; that the taxpayer was paid for his services whenever he required and called for payment for them and not on a regular basis.

(5) That the construction work of the apartment building was performed by subcontractors except that of a watchman and some labor which was performed by employees of the corporation.

(6) That no deductions were taken from the building from paid to the taxpayer for social security or income taxes; that the taxpayer was not listed as an employee of S.E.S. Building Corp.; that the taxpayer was covered by workmen's compensation insurance under a policy obtained by the S.E.S. Building Corp.

(7) That upon completion of the apartment building in 1960 the taxpayer continued in his business and his business of building one and two-family houses which business the taxpayer discontinued during the building of the apartment house.

Based upon the foregoing findings and all the evidence presented herein, the State Tax Commission hereby

RECOMMENDS:

(A) That the activities of the taxpayer in supervising the

construction of the apartment building for the A.H.G. Building Corp. were conducted by him as an independent contractor and not as an employee; that such activities constitute the carrying on of an unincorporated business, the income of which is subject to the unincorporated business tax within the intent and meaning of section 703 of the Tax Law.

(2) That accordingly the assessment issued for 1966 (Assessment No. AB006446) is correct and does not include any tax or other charge which could not have been lawfully demanded; that the taxpayer's application for revision or refund of unincorporated business taxes for the year 1966 be and the same is hereby denied.

Dated: Albany, New York this 13th day of July 1967.

FOR THE COMMISSION

/s/

JOSEPH H. MURPHY

/s/

JAMES R. MACDUFF

/s/

WALTER MACLYN CONLON