STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition of Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

•

:

for Redetermination of a Deficiency or Revision of a Determination or Refund of Sales & Use Tax : under Article 28 & 29 of the Tax Law for the Period 3/1/75-12/30/79. :

SS.:

State of New York :

County of Albany :

David Parchuck, being duly sworn, deposes and says that he is an employee of the State Tax Commission, that he is over 18 years of age, and that on the 31st day of December, 1984, he served the within notice of Decision by certified mail upon Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe, the petitioner in the within proceeding, by enclosing a true copy thereof in a securely sealed postpaid wrapper addressed as follows:

Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe 215 Covington Rd. W. Seneca, NY 14224

and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a post office under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

That deponent further says that the said addressee is the petitioner herein and that the address set forth on said wrapper is the last known address of the petitioner.

Sworn to before me this 31st day of December, 1984.

David Parchurk

Authorized to administer oaths

pursuant to Tax Law section 174

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition of Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

:

:

:

:

:

for Redetermination of a Deficiency or Revision of a Determination or Refund of Sales & Use Tax under Article 28 & 29 of the Tax Law for the Period 3/1/75-12/30/79.

State of New York :

SS.: County of Albany :

David Parchuck, being duly sworn, deposes and says that he is an employee of the State Tax Commission, that he is over 18 years of age, and that on the 31st day of December, 1984, he served the within notice of Decision by certified mail upon William J. Cotter, the representative of the petitioner in the within proceeding, by enclosing a true copy thereof in a securely sealed postpaid wrapper addressed as follows:

William J. Cotter 5109 Main St. Williamsville, NY 14221

and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a post office under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

That deponent further says that the said addressee is the representative of the petitioner herein and that the address set forth on said wrapper is the last known address of the representative of the petitioner.

Sworn to before me this 31st day of December, 1984.

David barchuck

Authorized to administer oaths pursuant to Tax Law section 174

SCATE OF NEW 20RE

3

STATE LAN CONSISSION

1011115 1 30 10 76/201 311 21

katikuun Custe dii 's Coster's Caro

for Pedaterrianitos of a Belfernary of Artistan of a Decemination of Reference fails, a use Tax ander Article 28 a 28 - 1 tak far for the Period 3/1/75-12/30/14

state of New York :

and the second second

t – Jacobia Sa videnci

Bavid Barchack, heren dette over nj. depeses and este viet 2000 over 1000 ok the diate for desminants of the dette over 1000 over 1000000 of the test of Bist day of here term the managers fill of the test mattee of theologies of the cartified and kapped billing to every the track opportent for the test of the the within proceeding, by evolveting a firm copy the test of the party for the second for the test of the party of the state of the test of the second for the test of test o

> Wittian J. Couter Sids Data St. Silliamsville - Mi 14101

an<mark>d by depasitions wa</mark>te eachwest is a protocity patho parato affin energy and a constant Pest efficie each the result for and and configuration for the fact for test for the fill bervice efficient and the sub-file form

l**ikat deposent funk**ier vers vors vors dard andersked is che represent en v of the prutitioner herain and unit fier chronolissen are initia un auto namer or on the last known address of the recencentive of the continuer.

> itern to **before** an this Bist day of December 1966.

Aucherized C. Londonarez backs Ruberized C. London Science (14

THE DEAD HIS STATE OF

ţ

STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION ALBANY, NEW YORK 12227

December 31, 1984

Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe 215 Covington Rd. W. Seneca, NY 14224

Dear Ms. Cotter:

Please take notice of the Decision of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

You have now exhausted your right of review at the administrative level. Pursuant to section(s) 1138 of the Tax Law, a proceeding in court to review an adverse decision by the State Tax Commission may be instituted only under Article 78 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, and must be commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, Albany County, within 4 months from the date of this notice.

Inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision may be addressed to:

> NYS Dept. Taxation and Finance Law Bureau - Litigation Unit Building #9, State Campus Albany, New York 12227 Phone # (518) 457-2070

> > Very truly yours,

STATE TAX COMMISSION

cc: Petitioner's Representative
William J. Cotter
5109 Main St.
Williamsville, NY 14221
Taxing Bureau's Representative

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

KATHLEEN COTTER D/B/A COTTER'S CAFE DECISION

for Revision of a Determination or for Refund : of Sales and Use Taxes under Articles 28 and 29 of the Tax Law for the Period March 1, 1975 : through December 30, 1979.

Petitioner, Kathleen Cotter, 215 Covington Road, West Seneca, New York 14224, filed a petition for revision of a determination or for refund of sales and use taxes under Articles 28 and 29 of the Tax Law for the period March 1, 1975 through December 30, 1979 (File No. 37942).

:

:

A small claims hearing was held before Arthur Johnson, Hearing Officer, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, 65 Court Street, Buffalo, New York, on April 24, 1984 at 2:45 P.M., with all briefs to be submitted by June 22, 1984. Petitioner appeared by William J. Cotter, Esq. The Audit Division appeared by John P. Dugan, Esq. (James Della Porta, Esq., of counsel).

ISSUE

Whether petitioner, the purchaser in a bulk sale, is liable for sales taxes determined to be due from the seller in accordance with section 1141(c) of the Tax Law.

FINDINGS OF FACT

 On December 3, 1979, petitioner, Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe, purchased a restaurant business owned and operated by Stone Bridge Cafe, Inc. ("The Corporation"). The Corporation had operated the business from February 17, 1978 to the date of sale. The Corporation purchased the business from Norman Hageman who operated the Stone Bridge Cafe as a sole proprietorship during the period March 1, 1975 through February 16, 1978.

2. When the business assets were transferred from Hageman to The Corporation, the Audit Division mailed a questionnaire to Hageman requesting certain information concerning the bulk sale. Hageman did not respond to the questionnaire and, consequently, the Audit Division issued a Notice of Determination and Demand for Payment of Sales and Use Taxes Due (#S780330722C) against Hageman on April 14, 1978 covering the period March 1, 1975 through February 16, 1978 for taxes due of \$6,571.21 plus penalty and interest. Hageman neither paid nor protested this assessment.

The aforesaid notice was in addition to five notices and demand for payment of sales and use taxes due that were issued to Hageman for filing returns with no remittance or for penalty and interest charged on the late filing of returns (#'s S0091908363, S0091908364, S0091908365, S0091918900 and S0091974024).

3. On April 14, 1978, the Audit Division issued a Notice and Demand for Payment of Sales and Use Taxes Due (#S780330723C) against The Corporation which asserted taxes due of \$7,801.71, plus penalty and interest. Said notice indicated that the taxes were determined due from Stone Bridge Cafe (Hageman) and represented The Corporation's liability as purchaser in accordance with section 1141(c) of the Tax Law. The amount of the assessment was for notices S780330722C and S0091918900 issued to Stone Bridge Cafe. The Corporation did not protest the above assessments.

4. During the period February 17, 1978 through December 3, 1979, in which The Corporation operated the business, it was delinquent in filing sales tax

-2-

.

returns and, as a result, the Audit Division issued notices and demands for penalty and interest.

After the business was sold to petitioner, The Corporation did not respond to a bulk sale questionnaire from the Audit Division regarding the business operations. Because there was no response, the Audit Division issued a Notice of Determination and Demand for Payment of Sales and Use Taxes Due on December 9, 1980 (#S801202724C) against The Corporation. Said notice assessed taxes due of \$2,835.64 plus penalty and interest for the above period and indicated that, based on a review of returns filed and the failure to submit the information requested, reported taxable sales were increased 25 percent. This assessment was not protested.

5. On September 25, 1980, the Audit Division notified petitioner of a possible claim for New York State and local sales and use taxes from the seller (The Corporation). The notification stated that no distribution of funds or property to the extent of the amount of the State's claim could be made before the following conditions were met:

- "1. The State Tax Commission has determined the seller's liability, if any.
- 2. Payment of such liability has been made to the State.
- 3. This office has authorized you to release the funds or property."

Petitioner did not notify the Audit Division of the purchase of the business assets of The Corporation. 1

6. On December 9, 1980, the Audit Division issued notices of determination and demand for payment of sales and use taxes due (#'s S801202725C and S801202726C) against petitioner covering the period March 1, 1975 through February 29, 1980 for taxes due totalling \$10,637.35, plus penalty and interest.

¹ The record does not establish when or how the Audit Division was notified of the sale.

Petitioner was held liable for taxes determined due from The Corporation pursuant to section 1141(c) of the Tax Law. Petitioner filed a protest on December 15, 1980.

On February 16, 1982, the Audit Division issued notices of assessment review to The Corporation and petitioner which reduced notice #S801202724C and #S801202726C by \$420.00 based on the deletion of the period ending February 29, 1980.

7. A conference was held on January 27, 1982 with representatives of the Buffalo District Office. Petitioner produced purchase invoices for the months of August, 1979 through November, 1979, a sales contract and certain income statements. From these records, the Audit Division determined that the reported markup by The Corporation was 141 percent. Industry guidelines for this type of operation show that the markup for beer and liquor should be 150 percent and 225 percent, respectively. Therefore, no adjustment was made to the notice. It was also determined from the sales contract that the furniture and fixtures were sold for \$10,000.00 and that the taxes due thereon of \$700.00 were not assessed against The Corporation or petitioner. The conference revealed that The Corporation had been assessed \$420.00 in taxes for the month of December, 1979 when it was no longer in operation.

The bulk sales tax of \$700.00 was assessed against The Corporation and petitioner under separate notices dated February 26, 1982.

8. Three payments have been made on the sales tax liabilities of petitioner's predecessors in interest. The first payment was in February, 1981 in the amount of \$3,167.44. This amount was paid from funds held by Vincent R. DiPasquale as escrow agent on the bulk sale between Hageman and The Corporation and was applied as follows:

-4-

Item		Amount	Notice #
and interest	penalty	\$ 35.91	S0091908363
and interest	penalty	245.53	S0091908364
and interest	penalty	133.87	S0091908365
	tax	1,230.50	S0091918900
and interest	penalty	952.37	
and interest	penalty	569.26	S0091974024

On September 14, 1983, a payment of \$1,685.21 was made in satisfaction of assessments against Michael Dickman individually as responsible officer of The Corporation. The assessments were for penalty and interest charges on the late filing of returns. These charges were not included on the notices issued to petitioner. Therefore, the payment of \$1,685.21 does not affect petitioner's liability.

The third payment on the liability of The Corporation resulted from the transmittal of a State Liquor Authority refund check in the amount of \$970.00. The sum of \$934.11 was applied to penalty and interest due on notice #D7901251139. The remaining \$35.89 was applied to penalty and interest due on notice #D7904083051 for the period ending November 30, 1980. However, the penalty and interest due for said period was satisfied with the payment of \$1,685.21 made by Dickman. Therefore, \$35.89 must be reapplied to other liabilities of The Corporation.

9. At the hearing, petitioner conceded her liability for the bulk sales tax of \$700.00 set forth in Finding of Fact "7", supra.

10. Petitioner argued that she was not aware that the sales tax liabilities of The Corporation or its predecessor Hageman existed when the business was purchased. Petitioner further argued that the Audit Division should first attempt to collect the tax from Hageman and The Corporation.

Petitioner offered no evidence to show that there were any additional payments made against the notices referred to above.

-5-

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

A. That section 1141(c) of the Tax Law provides, in pertinent part, that a purchaser in a bulk sale of business assets must notify the Tax Commission of the proposed sale at least ten days before taking posession of the subject of the sale. Whenever the purchaser fails to give notice to the tax commission as required, or whenever the tax commission informs the purchaser that a possible claim for taxes exist, any sums of money or other consideration which the purchaser is required to transfer over to the seller shall be subject to a first priority right and lien for any such taxes determined to be due from the seller. Within ninety days of receipt of the notice of the sale from the purchaser, the Tax Commission shall give notice to the purchaser of the total amount of any taxes which the state claims to be due from the seller.

For failure to comply with the provisions of section 1141(c) of the Tax Law, the purchaser is personally liable for the payment to the state of any taxes determined to be due from the seller.

B. That petitioner failed to notify the Tax Commission of the sale and transferred funds to the seller prior to being notified of the amount of the state's claim for taxes due from The Corporation. Accordingly, petitioner is personally liable for the payment of such taxes pursuant to section 1141(c) of the Tax Law.

C. That the notices issued against petitioner (#'s S801202725C and S801202726C) shall be adjusted as follows:

1) period ending May 31, 1977 should be reduced to \$84.75

2) period ending February 29, 1980, \$420.00 should be deleted

3) the duplicate payment of \$35.89 should be deducted

D. That the petition of Kathleen Cotter d/b/a Cotter's Cafe is granted to the extent indicated in Conclusion of Law "C"; that in all other respects, the

-6-

petition is denied and the notices of determination and demand for payment of sales and use taxes due issued December 9, 1980 and February 26, 1982 are sustained.

DATED: Albany, New York

DEC 31 1984

STATE TAX COMMISSION

PRESIDENT COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

P 470 316 339

RECEIPT FOR CERTIFIED MAIL

.

÷

	(See Reverse)	
	Sent tolling Catter	
	Street and No.	7
	P.Q., State and ZIP Code 74	11422
	Postage	\$
	Certified Fee	
	Special Delivery Fee	
	Restricted Delivery Fee	
	Return Receipt Showing to whom and Date Delivered	
2	Return Receipt Showing to whom, Date, and Address of Delivery	
PS Form 3800, Feb. 1982	TOTAL Postage and Fees	\$
, Fet	Postmark or Date	
3800		
Form		
PS I		

470 316 338 Ρ RECEIPT FOR CERTIFIED MAIL

.

NO INSURANCE COVERAGE PROVIDED-NOT FOR INTERNATIONAL MAIL

(See Reverse)	11-
alters Catter i	\$b\$
Street and No. Cufe	//
P.O. State and ZIP Code	Rd.
Postige States NY	423
Certified Fee	
Special Delivery Fee	
Restricted Delivery Fee	
Return Receipt Showing to whom and Date Delivered	
Return Receipt Showing to whom,	
TOTAL Postage and Fees	\$
Postmark or Date	
•	•
* +	
	• • • • •
	Sent to The Callel C Street and No. P.O., State and Zip Code P.O., State and Zip Code P.O., State and Zip Code Postige State and Address of Delivery TOTAL Postage and Fees