In the Matter of the Petition

of

Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

for Redetermination of a Deficiency or a Revision of a Determination or a Refund of Personal Income Tax under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the Year 1970.

State of New York County of Albany

Jay Vredenburg, being duly sworn, deposes and says that he is an employee of the Department of Taxation and Finance, over 18 years of age, and that on the 31st day of August, 1979, he served the within notice of Default by certified mail upon Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer, the petitioner in the within proceeding, by enclosing a true copy thereof in a securely sealed postpaid wrapper addressed as follows:

Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer 1280 Virginia Ave.

Mountainside, NJ 07092 and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a (post office or official depository) under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

That deponent further says that the said addressee is the petitioner herein and that the address set forth on said wrapper is the last known address of the petitioner.

Sworn to before me this 31st day of August, 1979.

J. Vily



STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION TAX APPEALS BUREAU ALBANY, NEW YORK 12227

STATE TAX COMMISSION
JAMES H. TULLY JR., PRESIDENT
MILTON KOERNER
THOMAS H. LYNCH

JOHN J. SOLLECITO DIRECTOR

Telephone: (518) 457-1723

August 31, 1979

Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer 1280 Virginia Ave. Mountainside, NJ 07092

Dear Mr. & Mrs. Speer:

Please take notice of the Default Order of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

Please take further notice that pursuant to Section(s) 690 of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review this decision must be commenced within 4 months from the date of this notice.

Inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision may be addressed to the Deputy Commissioner and Counsel to the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, Albany, New York 12227. Said inquiries will be referred to the proper authority for reply.

Very truly yours,

cc: Petitioner's Representative

Taxing Bureau's Representative

STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER

DEFAULT ORDER

for Redetermination of Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income
Taxes under Article(X) 22 of the Tax Law for the Year(X) 1970

Petitioner(s) Francis A. Speer & Kathleen M. Speer, Carthage Arms, Apt #6

Carthage, New York 13619 filed a petition for redetermination of deficiency or for refund of Personal Income taxes under Article(%)

of the Tax Law for the year (%) 1970 . File No. (%) 13862

not appear at the Small Claims Hearing . A default has been duly noted.

Now on motion of the attorney for the Department of Taxation and Finance, it is

ORDERED that the petition of FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER be and the same is hereby denied.

DATED: Albany, New York

AUG 3 1 1979

STATE TAX COMMISSION

COMMISS ONER

COMMISSIONER



To....Mr. Coburn

Better address. Remailed 9/14/79

9/14/79

Joseph Chyrywaty

M-75 (5/76)

In the Matter of the Petition

of

FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER

AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING

State of New York County of Albany

and by depositing same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper in a (post office or official depository) under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service within the State of New York.

Sworn to before me this

14th day, of September , 1979

REQUEST FOR BETTER ADDRESS

Requested by	70	Unit	Date of Request		
tim	r. Luci	Lax appeals Bu, 2m102,13ldg 9	9/11/20		
	· .	RmK2, Filly	1112/1/		
Please find most recent address of taxpayer described below; return to person named above.					
Social Security N	lumber	Date of Petition			
169.09	6675	73/01/16			
Speck, I RMKCIS F). + KATHEELN M.					
Address					
1.280	LIREININ ALGAC	C. C.			
Marin	DIKSIDE, KJ CJOT				
	le Co				
Results of search by Files					
	CARTHAGE, W. 19319				
New address:					
	CARINATE, WITH T				
Same as above, no better address					
Other:					
Searched by	V	Section	Date of Search		
		M.I.	4 12, 79		
			"		

PERMANENT RECORD

FOR INSERTION IN TAXPAYER'S FOLDER

TA-26 (4-76) 25M

STATE OF NEW YORK

Department of Taxation and Finance

TAX APPEALS BUREAU STATE CAMPUS

ALBANY, N. Y. 12227

Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer 1280 Virginia Ave. Mountainside, NJ 07092



Paul B. Coburn Secretary to the State Tax Commission

September 30, 1980

Price Waterhouse & Company 986 Bedford Street Stanford, Connecticut 06905

RE: FRANCIS A. & KATHLEEN M. SPEER

Gentlemen:

Please be advised that State Tax Commissioner Thomas H. Lynch has vacated the default order entered against your client, Francis A. and Kathleen M. Speer.

I have this date advised the Tax Appeals Bureau that the default order has been vacated. They will reschedule the matter for a hearing.

MUM

becretary to the State Tax Commission

PBC:mac

Cc: John Sollecito, Director
Tax Appeals Bureau
Michael Alexander

Michael Alexander Law Bureau

DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE MEMORANDUM

TO: Paul Coburn,

Re: Francis A. & Kathleen M. Speer Request to reopen default

The default should be vacated.

THL

9/26/80 Attachment--corresp.



Thomas H. Lynch
Tax Commissioner



986 BEDFORD STREET STAMFORD, CONNECTICUT 06905 203-325-2623

August 28, 1980

Secretary to the State Tax Commission Department of Taxation and Finance Room 214-A, Building 9 State Campus Albany, New York 12227

Dear Sir:

FRANCIS A. AND KATHLEEN M. SPEER 169-09-6675 1970

The above-named taxpayers hereby seek relief from a default order dated August 31, 1979 entered in the Matter of their Petition for Redetermination of Deficiency of personal income tax under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the year 1970. The enclosed memorandum and exhibits will show that there exist both a valid excuse for the default and a meritorious defense for the positions taken in their return. Even if there were not a valid excuse for default and a meritorious defense for the positions taken in their return, it is submitted that the State has failed to exercise reasonable diligence in responding to the taxpayers' petition to such an extent that it should be prohibited from asserting any deficiency.

The relief sought is alternatively either: 1) that the State be barred from collecting the assessed deficiency because of its failure to decide the taxpayers' case as quickly as practicable, 2) that the default be reopened and the taxpayers' petition be granted as filed because of the State's failure to respond to the petition in accordance with its own regulations, or 3) that the default be reopened and the taxpayers be given an opportunity to contest the deficiency because there is a valid excuse for the default and a meritorious defense for the positions taken in the return.

Any corrrespondence relating to this matter should be sent to Mr. Arthur B. Cilley of this office.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Yours very truly,
Price Waterhouse & 6 5500

Enclosures - As stated

cc: Mr. & Mrs. Francis A. Speer

FRANCIS A. AND KATHLEEN M. SPEER

169-09-6675

1970

Background

A deficiency of \$1,444.82 was assessed against the taxpayers with respect to their 1970 New York State nonresident income tax return. The issue concerned the treatment of days worked outside New York State by Mr. Speer at his home in Mountainside, New Jersey.

In response to a letter dated January 4, 1974 from Gabriel B. DiCerbo, Chief-Regulations and Interpretations Section, Income Tax Bureau, the taxpayers completed Form IT-95, Item #4, and had their signatures notarized on January 14, 1974. This form was sent to the State Tax Commission and to the best of their knowledge perfected the petition for redetermination of deficiency in accordance with the provisions of Reg. Sec. 601.5 of the Procedural Regulations of the State Tax Commission.

To the best of the taxpayers' recollection, no further communication was received from New York State concerning this matter until on or about May 25, 1980 when they received a Notice and Demand for Payment of Income Tax Due dated May 22, 1980. In the intervening period, the taxpayers discarded their 1970 tax records in the good faith belief that the matter had been dropped by the State.

Excuse for default

As stated above, no communications relating to the 1970 petition were received after January 1974 until May 1980. In particular, the Amended Notice of Small Claims Hearing dated February 15, 1979 was never received. A copy of this document was furnished to an employee of our firm in June 1980 by Mr. Donald Lounsbury of Audit Group 5. It appears from a notation in the bottom right hand corner of the notice, which reads "This amended notice contains taxpayers' current address," that an earlier notice was sent to a different address. In view of the fact that the earlier notice was evidently not received by the taxpayers, the State should have taken greater efforts than usual to be sure that the amended notice was received. If the State has evidence that the amended notice was received, such as a certified mail receipt, the State should be required to produce it.

Sec. 689 of the Tax Law provides that "no petition shall be denied in whole or in part without opportunity for a hearing on reasonable prior notice." Where the State has taken more than five years from the time of its last communication, is aware of the taxpayers' change of address, and is aware that the new residence is within New York State so that notice by personal service is made readily available, reasonable prior notice surely requires more than a simple letter sent by ordinary mail with no proof of receipt.

Because the taxpayers have no recollection of receiving the notice of hearing and the State has not proved that they did receive such notice, there is a valid excuse for the default.

Meritorious defense for positions taken in return

A nonresident of New York is taxable on items of income from New York sources. Sec. 632 (b)(1)(B) of the Tax Law states that income from New York sources includes income attributable to a business trade, profession or occupation carried on in New York. Sec. 632 (c) states that if an occupation is carried on partly within and partly without the State, income therefrom shall be apportioned according to regulations.

Reg. Sec. 131.4 states the general rule that compensation for personal services rendered by a nonresident employee without New York is not taxable. Reg. Sec. 131.16 states that if a nonresident employee performs services for his employer both within and without the State, his income derived from New York sources includes only that proportion of his total compensation for services rendered as an employee which the total number of working days employed within the State bears to the total number of working days employed both within and without the State.

It has been held that days worked without the State solely for the convenience of the employee are not counted as days worked without the State. Morehouse v. Murphy et al., 10 A.D. 2d 764(1960). The information in Item #4 of Form IT-95 indicates that Mr. Speer's situation was clearly distinguishable from the situation in Morehouse. Supporting information and a confirmatory letter from the employer are apparently included in the taxpayers' file.

Inasmuch as a meritorious defense exists and is supported by information in the State's possession, it is requested that the information be provided to the taxpayers so that the issues may be presented and resolved as fully and fairly as possible.

Failure to exercise reasonable diligence

Sec. 689 of the Tax Law provides that "proceedings before the tax commission in any case initiated by the filing of a petition, shall be governed by such rules as the tax commission shall prescribe." The section further provides that "the tax commissioners shall, acting as a body, jointly decide the case as quickly as practicable."

Reg. Sec. 601.5(a) provides:

Where the Secretary determines that the petition is properly perfected, he will immediately forward it, along with the file, to the Law Bureau for preparation of the answer. The time within which the Law Bureau must answer the petition shall start to run from the date of the notice to the petitioner that the original petition is acceptable as a perfected petition or from the date of service of the perfected petition on the Secretary, unless the Secretary notifies the petitioner within 20 days after service upon him that the perfected petition is not acceptable.

Reg. Sec. 601.6(a)(1) provides that the Law Bureau shall serve the answer 60 days from the date the Secretary acknowledges receipt of an acceptable perfected petition.

The taxpayers did not receive an answer within 60 days from the date of service on the Secretary of the perfected petition. Indeed, they did not receive an answer within six years from the date of service on the Secretary of the perfected petition. The Commission has therefore failed to observe its own regulations.

It is further submitted that this extraordinary delay at such an early stage of the proceeding violates the legislative mandate that the case should be decided as quickly as practicable. In reliance on this extraordinary delay the taxpayers disposed of their records relating to the tax year involved on the understanding that the matter had been dropped. It would be unreasonable to require that they reestablish a case for the positions taken in their return when, as a result of the State's delay, the relevant facts and supporting evidence are so far in the past. Accordingly, the State should be barred from collecting the alleged deficiency.

Stamford, Connecticut August 28, 1980

NEW YORK STATE INCOME TAX State Campus, Albany, New York 12227

NOTICE AND DEMAND FOR PAYMENT OF INCOME TAX DUE

PERIOD OR YEAR	DATE OF ASSESSMENT	FILES REFERENCE NO.	ASSESSMENT NO.
1970	° 05-22- 80 >	5 3031125	A 8004061401

169-09-6675

SPEER-FRANCIS A & KATHLEEN N -CARTHAGE ARMS APTH6 CARTHAGE NY 1361

THIS IS A NOTICE AND DEMAND FOR PAYMENT OF THE AMOUNT DUE SHOWN ON THE LINE BELOW.

PERSONAL INCOME TAX	1,444.82	UNINCORPORATED BUSINESS TAX	O TOTAL TAX	1,444.82	173.03
PENALTY	•00	PENALTY • C	TOTAL FENALTY	•00	TOTAL TAX, PEN. & INT 1,617.85
					PREVIOUSLY PAID
	- KEED TL	IIS NOTICE FOR YOUR RE	CORDS -		UNPAID BALANCE 1,617.85
•	7	IS NOTICE FOR FOOR RE			ADDITIONAL PEN, AND/OR INT. 616 • 06
- 1. · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				•	2,233.91
				•	A PAY THIS AMOUNT A

The reasons for the AMOUNT DUE are as follows:

FAILURE TO PAY AMOUNT DUE AS PREVIOUSLY SHOWN ON STATEMENT OF AUDIT CHANGES OR NOTICE OF ADDITIONAL TAX DUE.

PENALTY AND INTEREST CHARGES (IF APPLICABLE) HAVE BEEN ADDED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE NEW YORK STATE TAX LAW.

Return ONE COPY OF THIS NOTICE WITH YOUR REMITTANCE made payable to the State Tax Commission: the enclosed envelope. Write the assessment number shown above on your remittance. Keep on copy of this notice for your records.

• If this notice is not paid within 10 days, additional interest and penalty will accrue

STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER

DEFAULT ORDER

for Redetermination of Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income
Taxes under Article(X) 22 of the Tax Lav for the Year(X) 1970

Petitioner(s) Francis A. Speer & Kathleen M. Speer, Carthage Arms, Apt #6

Carthage, New York 13619 filed a petition for redetermination of deficiency or for refund of Personal Income taxes under Article (%)

of the Tax Law for the year (%) 1970

. File No. (3) 13862

A Small Claims Hearing on the petition was scheduled before

William Valcarcel, Hearing Officer , at the offices of the State

Tax Commission, Two World Trade Center, 65th Floor, Room 65-51, New York, New York

on Friday, March 9, 1979 at 10:45 A.M. . Notice of said Small Claims

Hearing was given to petitioner(s) ** **TOTATION OFFICE AND OFFICE AND

not appear at the Small Claims Hearing . A default has been duly noted.

Now on motion of the attorney for the Department of Taxation and Finance, it is

ORDERED that the petition of FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER be and the same is hereby denied.

DATED: Albany, New York

AUG 3 1 1979

TATE TAX COMMISSION

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

1 ACT



STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION TAX APPEALS BUREAU ALBANY, NEW YORK 12227

JOHN J. SOLLECITO DIRECTOR

Please address your reply to:

Telephone: (518)457-1723

STATE TAX COMMISSION

JAMES H. TULLY JR., PRESIDENT MILTON KOERNER THOMAS H. LYNCH

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition

of

FRANCIS A. SPEER and KATHLEEN M. SPEER

for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income Taxes under Article(s) 22 of the Tax Law for the Year(s) 1970.

AMENDED NOTICE OF SMALL CLAIMS HEARING

Juened 150

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that, pursuant to provisions of the Tax Law (Section(s) 689), a small claims hearing is scheduled to be held in the above-entitled matter at the offices of the State Tax Commission, Two World Trade Center, 65th Floor, Room 65-51, New York, New York, on Friday, March 9, 1979 at 10:45 A.M.

The petitioner has the burden of proof and must establish by a preponderance of the evidence all facts necessary to show that there is no deficiency, or that a

Such proof may be made by sworn testimony of the petitioner or his witnesses or by documentary or other written evidence to be introduced during the course of the formal hearing.

Failure to appear at the scheduled hearing may result in dismissal of the petition. Adjournment may be requested but will be granted only for good cause and only to such time and place as the State Tax Commission finds appropriate.

Handicapped persons who may require assistance in gaining access to this building are requested to so advise the Tax Appeals Bureau at (518) 457-1723, Ext. 20, within two (2) weeks from the date of this notice.

PETITIONER: Mr. & Mrs. Francis A. Speer

Carthage Arms Apt. #6 Carthage, NY 13619

DATED: Albany, New York February 15, 1979

STATE TAX

HY

OL 165

COMMISSION

cc: Petitioner's Representative: None

Taxing Bureau's Representative

THIS AMENDED NOTICE CONTAINS TAXPAYERS! CURRENT ADDRESS

OR

Refund of \$______ is requested. Notice of disallowance was dated______

of destisoin, determined under date of _________

OR

Refund of \$______ is requested. No notice of disallowance has been received, but claim for such refund was filed on or about ______, 19.

Lach ground upon which redetermination of the deficiency or refund is claimed, and the facts relied upon to inform the State Tax Commission of the exact basis thereof, are as follows: (Attach additional sheets if required.)

Compensation for the months of ect, Nov, * Dec. 1970 Hove Been Erroneously Evaluated and interpreted.

Ouring this period I was paid By Crane Co. to Be Hualable for Consultation and Special Assignment. The Nature of this Hawangement Did Not Require My Presence in New Yeak, Henever I was in a daily work status entside the State.

This period Should be Chassified as Days worked entside. New york and is sufferted by Detailed Explanation and a Confirming Letter from my Employer in your Files.

5. No petition for redetermination of deficiency or for refund has heretofore been filed

with the State Tax Commission in respect of any of the items hereinbefore stated, nor has any redetermination of deficiency or refund been previously granted thereon.

(Signature of taxpayer or representative)

Sworn to before me

this will day of free.

19 74

Letense Tuesdome Com to the North

My Commence Empires (1919), 1975

NOTE: If petition is signed by any person other than the taxpayer, it must be accompanied by a duly executed power of attorney unless either (1) a power of attorney has already been filed, or (2) the taxpayer is a minor whose return was filed by the person signing the petition or is mentally or physically incapable of signing.

A petition may be filed covering more than one taxable year only if the taxpayer has received a notice of deficiency or notice of disallowance of refund covering all years to which the petition relates.

 $\int \int d$

(518)457-2277

Prancis A. and Eathleen H. Speer 1200 Virginia Avenue Hountainside, Kew Jersey 07002

JAN 4 1978

RE: Patition to State Tax Commission For Year 1973 Pile 60-53032125

pear Mr. and Mrs. Speers

This will asknowledge the petition form received in commention with the above tax year. In order to perfect this petition is to reveseary the significate be notarised. Amorthogly, we are returning a copy of the petition so that the proper notarisation may be rade.

The basis for filing the petition have not been stated as required under Item 64, back of Form IT-95.

As soon as a persected polition has been received further consideration will be given.

All correspondence should refer to Division 50, P.O. Bex 5048, Albany, R. Y., 12255. And cavaloge is enclosed for your convenience.

Very truly yours,

PLT/ad Enc: 1 17-95 Envelope Cabriel B. Figorbo, Chief Regulations & Interpretations Section Income Yax Euranu

17 155

EXHIBIT VI

STATE OF NEW YORK STATE TAX COMMISSION

P.O. BOX 5028 Albany, N.Y. 12205

PETITION

FOR REDETERMINATION OF DEFICIENCY OR FOR REFUND OF PERSONAL INCOME TAX OR UNINCORPORATED BUSINESS TAX FOR THE YEAR(S) 19

	,	Social Security No.	169-09	-6675
		or		
		Employer Identification	on No	
Taxpayer FRance	us A.	and Kathheen	M.	SPEER
Address Son	return - also, sta	to present address if differ	·	
4	_			
Address		·		
recognized		cannot ordinarily be attorney is on file;		NEW YORK STATE INCOME TAX BUREAU INCOME TAX BUREAU INCOME TAX UNIT
STATE OF				REVIEW UNIT ALBANY OFFICE
COUNTY OF) ss:)			Alive
I (We), or representative ab- ficiency or for refun- support of such appli	d of tax paid, pur	duly sworn, do hereby rsuant to section 689 of the bllows:	petition for he New Yor	, the taxpayer(s) redetermination of de- k State Tax Law, and in
1. The tax is	n question is for t	he taxable year(s) or peri	od(s)	1970
2. The total	amount of tax pai	d for each year or period	is <u>100</u>	5.00
				() 25 P 3 8 8

1 - 17:38 (5,71) Part 7	STATE OF NEW YORK	EXHIBIT V	
	DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AN	D FINANCE	
	State Campus		ì
	◆ Albany, N. Y. 12227	Apr	
	STATEMENT OF AUDIT CHAI	APR 1 3 1972	
378	STATEMENT OF AUDIT CITA	10/3	19772
. 71	•	<u> </u>	Date
***		,	Duie
	South Land Comment	•	
•		•	
		File Number : 0-530311	98
PRANCIS A. CPERR A		7 / Taxable Year(s) : 1970	
EATHERN N. CITER,		S.S. No. Taxpayer: 159-09-6	675
Villa interior de la constante		S.S. No. Spouse : 172-14-5	
	ABUS ARTEL	DIVISION NO. :	
CAN (AMEE	ARMS APT. #6	.	
CARTHAGE, N	1,7. 13619		
Explanation:			
here at home are not a prose	er basis for ellecation of sa	dary icesse. Since the	
informazion entricami indica	teen that you work cansidates	le full time capinyes of	
Crane Couseny for the month	e of October. Hovember and bi	caller, 1990 and like the	
cervices rundered curies this	is period with previous which	i estid taro tem temined	
at your exployers how York !	place of Luminass, no allocat	tion of entary total 18	
allowed for drys opens at la	mae for those souths. Corre	ited comparation of sea to	
ealary is chose below.			
	505		
Total days in year,	365		
Bonnetk days			
Total work doys	693	•	
Days worked cutaide Ear Tor	k State <u>97</u> to 146		}
Days worked in New York Sta	148		
THE STATE OF CO. CO. OF MANY STREET	an Lame	\$33,045.00	1
166 x \$55,000.00 = Now York	BRITALY	4334413444	l l
\$33,005.00 x \$5,211.00 = It	entand deduction	<u>3,207,00</u>	
\$33,7,3,00	- Tanach - August	And the second s	
Balance		\$29,879.90	
Exception		1,010.00	
Tanable issume		\$27,505.50	
S manera a manera de la companya del la companya de			
Tax on the allive income	\$2,474.82		
Statutory espoit			1
Tax due			
Tex computed	1,03,00		ļ
4			\$1,644.00
ADDITIONAL PURCONAL TAX DUB			1 .
	•		1:3.6
		,	12:20
src/es (la carre			× 3 - 3 - 5 - 5
	AYMENTS RECEIVED		16/28
1. 2.	3.		100m
		Interest	
		TOTAL DUE	
DATE CONSENT RECEIVED NONE	INTEREST INSTRUCTIONS.	ASSESSMENT	
NOTICE AND REMAND AUTHORIZED BY:	1 180 181,444.82 4-15-71 t	A TE PERSONAL INCOME	=1,444.8-
R Luclan, 4-20	1 80 18144487 4-15-114	PENALTY	<u> [</u>
• •	13 -		<u> </u> 5
CONTROLLING DATE STATUTE OF EIGHTATIONS		PENALTY	<u> 5</u>