

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE

STATE TAX COMMISSION HEARING UNIT

> EDWARD ROOK SECRETARY TO COMMISSION

ADDRESS YOUR REPLY TO

MR. WRIGHT 457-2655

MR. LEISNER 457-2657 MR. COBURN 457-2896

STATE TAX COMMISSION

MARIO A. PROCACCINO, PRESIDENT A. BRUCE MANLEY MILTON KOERNER

BUILDING 9, ROOM 214-A STATE CAMPUS **ALBANY, N.Y. 12227**

AREA CODE 518

DATED: Albany, New York January 29, 1975

Miami Beach, Florida

Mr. Harry S. Dube 5700 Collins Avenue

33140

Dear Mr. Dube:

Please take notice of the CONSOLIDATED DECISION of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

Please take further notice that pursuant to Section(s) 722 and 690 of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review an adverse decision must be commenced within 4 months sion must be commenced within from the date of this notice.

Any inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision or concerning any other matter relative hereto may be addressed to the undersigned. These will be referred to the proper party for reply.

Very truly yours,

Nigel G. Wright

HEARING OFFICER

Enc.

Petitioner's Representative

Law Bureau

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition of MARRY S. DUBE and STEPHEN R. CASPER, Individually and as copartners d/b/u the firm name and style of CIRCUS MAGAZINE for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Unincorporated Business: Taxes under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968. In the Matter of the Petition of HARRY S. DUBE for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income Taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968. In the Matter of the Petition of STEPHEN R. and BONNIE F. CASPER for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income Taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968.

CONSOLIDATED DECISION

Harry S. Dube and Stephen R. Casper, individually and as copartners d/b/u the firm name and style of Circus Magazine filed a petition for the redetermination of a deficiency issued under date of February 22, 1971, in the amount of \$2,884.16 plus interest of \$320.57 for a total of \$3,204.73 for unincorporated business taxes under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the year 1968.

Harry S. Dube filed a petition for a refund of \$1,346.87 out of estimated taxes which he had paid in personal income taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the year 1968. Said claim was allowed only to the extent of \$498.68 plus interest of \$46.35 for a total of \$545.03 which has been refunded. The remainder of the claim was denied because of a finding that petitioner's total liability was \$1,601.32 instead of the total liability of \$753.13 shown on his resident and nonresident returns.

Stephen R. and Bonnie F. Casper filed a petition for the redetermination of a Deficiency issued under date of February 22, 1971, in the amount of \$828.29 plus a penalty under section 685(a) of the Tax Law of \$207.22 and interest of \$92.13 for a total of \$1,128.24 for personal income tax under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the year 1968.

A hearing was duly held on September 11, 1972, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, 80 Centre Street, New York, New York, before Nigel G. Wright, Hearing Officer. The petitioners were represented by Charles S.P. Barker, Esq., of Reavis & McGrath and

by Edward H. Eisenstein, C.P.A. The Income Tax Bureau was represented by Saul Heckelman, Esq., appearing by Solomon Sies, Esq., of counsel.

The record of said hearing has been duly examined and considered.

ISSUE

The issue in this case is whether the petitioners' partnership sold assets and realized income to itself or whether the individual partners sold their partnership interests with no income being realized by the partnership.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Circus Magazine of 340 East 64th Street was a partner-ship organized in New York with Mr. Harry S. Dube and Stephen R. Casper as partners.
- 2. Mr. Dube had been in advertising prior to 1941. Since 1941, he has had a contract with the Ringling Brothers Circus (Ringling Bros.-Barnum & Bailey Combined Shows, Inc.) to publish a program for distribution at their shows. This contract extended through the 1971 season.
- 3. Mr. Casper is Mr. Dube's nephew. He became a partner of Mr. Dube in 1966, it being Mr. Dube's desire to retire shortly and commande for Mr. Casper to take over the entire business. Each one contributed the same amount of cash. Mr. Dube was to receive a small salary after which profits were distributed equally. The partnership was to last until December 31, 1971. Mr. Dube contributed the Ringling Brothers' contract to the partnership with

provision made in the agreement for Mr. Dube's protection in the event of the early termination of the partnership. The Ringling Brothers Circus consented to the partnership.

- 4. In 1967, the Ringling Brothers Circus was sold by the Ringling and North families to a group of investors. The Ringling Brothers Circus then, on January 2, 1968, entered into a contract for the acquisition of Circus Magainze.
- 5. The contract provides that "Dube and Casper hereby sell, and Ringling Bros. hereby purchases, ... their entire partnership interests in Magazine ... ", "Magazine" referring to the "partnership transacting business under the name of the Circus Magazine ... It also provides: "That Dube and Casper are all the partners of Magazine and own all the assets thereof, and have the absolute right to sell, transfer and assign all the assets of Magazine ..."
- 6. The purchase price was \$68,750.00 on the closing date,
 January 29, 1968, with three deferred payments annually thereafter,
 each contingent upon Mr. Dube's survival, of \$75,721.15, \$69,444.44
 and \$62,500.00 each with interest of 4% a year from the date of the
 contract. In addition, Ringling Brothers Circus paid an amount to
 reimburse Mr. Dube and Mr. Casper for the costs already incurred
 of publishing for the 1968 season.
- 7. Mr. Dube changed his residence from New York to Florida on December 8, 1968. Mr. Casper was a nonresident of New York during 1968 and thereafter.

د د د دار د د د د د د

- 8. Each partner reported on his Federal income tax return the sale of a partnership interest each showing a cost basis of zero and reporting one-half of the total consideration but computing tax on only his one-half share of the amount received in 1968 \$34,375.00.
- 9. Circus Magazine filed a New York partnership return for 1968 showing only certain small expenses and reporting a loss.

 The return was marked "final return".
- 10. Mr. Dube filed a timely New York resident return and later, an amended resident return and a nonresident return. He reported the sale of his partnership interest on his resident return.
 - 11. Mr. Casper did not file a New York return for 1968.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

A. The petitioner, doing business as Circus Magazine, clearly sold the assets of the business either directly or in liquidation of the business under section 703(a) of the Tax Law, and the gain thereon is subject to tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law.

3. The deficiency is postalned and each and every petition and denied.

The refund claimed by Mr. Dube is granted.

DATEED: Albany, New York

January 29, 1975

STATE TAX COMMISSION

THE PRICE

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

Department of Taxation and Finance AD 32 (6-73) 250M STATE OF NEW YORK ALBANY, N. Y. 12227 STATE CAMPUS

CERTIFIED

No. 202108

Mostrosco unitronia de la constante de la cons Mr. Harky S. Dube

Miami Beach, Florida Colling Avenue

forward expired



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE

STATE TAX COMMISSION HEARING UNIT

> EDWARD ROOK SECRETARY TO COMMISSION

ADDRESS YOUR REPLY TO

MR. WRIGHT 457-2655

MR. LEISNER 457-2657 MR. COBURN 457-2896

STATE TAX COMMISSION

MARIO A. PROCACCINO, PRESIDENT A. BRUCE MANLEY MILTON KOERNER

BUILDING 9, ROOM 214-A STATE CAMPUS ALBANY, N.Y. 12227

AREA CODE 518

DATED: Albany, New York

January 29, 1975

The Circus Magazine c/o Harry S. Dube 5700 Collins Avenue Miami Beach, Florida

33140

Gentlemen:

Please take notice of the CONSOLIDATED DECISION of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

Please take further notice that pursuant to Section(s) 722 and 690 of the Tax Law, of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review an adverse decision must be commenced within 4 months from the date of this notice.

Any inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision or concerning any other matter relative hereto may be addressed to the undersigned. These will be referred to the proper party for reply.

Very truly yours,

Nigel G. Wright

HEARING OFFICER

Petitioner's Representative Law Bureau

AD-1.12 (8/73)

Enc.

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMUSSION

In the Matter of the Petition

اده

MARRY S. DUBE and STEPHER R. CASPER, Individually and as copertness d/b/u the firm mass and style of

CINCUS MAGASINS

for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Walmosporated Dusiness Taxes under Artivie 23 of the Tax Lew for the Year 1968.

In the Matter of the Petition

01

east i. Test

for a Redetermination of a Delighendy or for Refund of Maranas Theore These modes Article 22 of the Tox law for the Dear 1968.

In the Matter of the Petition

eΞ

Structure R. and Domite 7. Casper

for a Redetermination of a Soficiopor or for Refund of Ideopol Encape Thucs under Article 12 of the The Low for the Your 1968.

marry 8. Dube and Stephen R. Casper, individually and he copartners d/b/u the firm mane and style of Circus Magazine filled a petition for the redetermination of a deficiency issued maked date of February 22, 1971, is the amount of \$2,884.16 plus interfer of \$320.57 for a total of \$3,204.73 for unincorporated business under Article 23 of the Tax Low for the year 1968.

Party 8. Dube filed a petition for a refund of \$1,346,27 and of estimated taxes which he had paid in personal income taxes under Article 22 of the Tax lev for the year 1968; Said slaid was allowed only to the extent of \$498.68 plus interest of \$46,35 for a peril of \$545,03 which has been refunded. The remainder of the claiming danied because of a finding that petitioner's under kindility was \$1,601.32 instead of the total limitity of \$753,13 shows on his revisiont and homitations years.

Stophen N. and Joseph P. Capper filled a potition for the "
refetementation of a Deticion of Large States and Capper 22.

1971; in the assent of 1828:29 plus & publishing as sention design
of the Pax Law of 1207:22 and intercept of 02:11 first material

81:128:24 for personal assent that major brights 22 of the Sales and Assents that major brights 22 of the Sales and Sales

A bearing was duty bold on September 21, 1972, ht the States of the State test constantion, to Constant States, Low Took, Language bearing the States that the States of t

by Miward H. Misemetein, C.P.A. The Masone Tax Sureau was regresented by Saul Hackelman, Req., appearing by Solomon Plas, Mag., of counsel.

The record of said hearing has been duly exhained and compidered.

The issue in this case is whether the petitioners' parts willy sold assets and realised income to itself or whether the individual partners sold their partnership interests with no income being realised by the partnership.

FINDINGS OF FACE

- 1. The Clause Magnetine of 340 Mart 44th Struct was a perfect ship organized in New York with Mr. Hazny S. Man and Phophes M. Casper as partners.
- 2. Mr. Dobe had been in advertising prior to 1941. Miges : 1941, he has had a contract with the Riggling Brothers Circus (Ringling Bros.-Harnum & Bailey Combined Shows, Inc.) to gublish a program for distribution at their shows. This contract extended through the 1971 season.
- 3. Mr. Casper is Mr. Dube's nephew. He became a partitle off Mr. Dube in 1966, it being Mr. Dube's desire to retire shartly sail arrange for Mr. Casper to take over the entire business. Made and contributed the same amount of cash. Mr. Dube was to ressive a small salary after which profits were distributed equally. The partnership was to last until December 31, 1971. Mr. Dube con-

- the male of a partnership interest and should a positional before and should be seen and reported providing the test to the total seemidement on but well putting the on only the see-bill short of the seemide whellow her 1966 \$14.375.00.
- 9. Circus Magazine filed a New York participally solding for 1968 showing only certain small expanses and repositing a look. The return was marked "final return".
- 10. Mr. Dube filed a timely New York recodent return and a decreasiont return. The reported the sale of his partnership interest on his recident return.
 - 11. Mr. Gamper did not file a New York petura for 1968.
- A. The petitioner, doing business as Direct Magasine, planting sold the assets of the business either directly or in liquidation of the business under meetion 703(s) of the Tur Line, and the publication thereon is subject to tax under Article 23 of the Par Line.

provision made in the agreement for Mr. Dube's Motastian in the event of the early termination of the partmership. She Bingling Brothers Circum generated to the partmership.

- 4. In 1967, the Simpling Brothers Circus was sold by the Ringling and North families to a group of investors. The Ringling Brothers Circus them, on January 2, 1968, entered into a continue for the sequisition of Circus Magainne.
- 5. The contrast provides that "Nube and Casper hereby sell, and Ringling Bros. hereby purchases, ... their entire partnership interests in Magazine ... ". "Magazine" referring to the "partnership transacting business under the Same of the Girons Magazine ... It also provides: "That Dabe and Casper are all the partners of Magazine and own all the assets thereof, and have the absolute right to sell, transfer and assign all the assets of Magazine ..."
- 6. The purchase price was \$68,750,00 on the closing date, January 29, 1968, with three deferred payments annually thereafter, each contingent upon Mr. Dube's survival, of \$75,721.15, \$69,468,46 and \$62,500.00 each with interest of 4% a year from the date of the contract. In addition, Ringling Brothers Circus paid in amount to relaborate Mr. Dube and Mr. Casper for the costs already insurant of publishing for the 1968 season.
- 7. Mr. Dube dhinged his residence from New York to Florida an Describer 8, 1966. Mr. Campor was a numberident of New York and Mar 1968 and thereafter.

B. The designey to enstained and much and every political to denied.

The referd claimed by Mr. Dube is granted.

DATED: Albeny, New York

January 29, 1975

Cherry Dr.

Mater 16.

Department of Taxation and Finance AD 32 (6-73) 250M STATE OF NEW YORK ALBANY, N. Y. 12227 STATE CAMPUS

Party of town August Au The Circus Magazine 5700\Collins Avenue c/o Harry S. Dube

CERTIFIED No. 202106

forward expenses

Miami\Beach\Florida



STATE TAX COMMISSION

MILTON KOERNER

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE

STATE TAX COMMISSION THEARING UNIT

EDWARD ROOK SECRETARY TO

BUILDING 9, ROOM 214-A STATE CAMPUS ALBANY, N.Y. 12227

COMMISSION

MARIO A. PROCACCINO, PRESIDENT A. BRUCE MANLEY

AREA CODE 518

ADDRESS YOUR REPLY TO

ביש מיים ביים

MR. WRIGHT 457-2655 MR. LEISNER 457-2657 MR. COBURN 457-2896

DATED: Albany, New York January 29, 1975

Mr. & Mrs. Stephen R. Casper 5509 Belmont Avenue Cincinnati, Ohio

Dear Mr. & Mrs. Casper:

Please take notice of the CONSOLIDATED DECISION of the State Tax Commission enclosed herewith.

Please take further notice that pursuant to Section(s) 722 and 690 of the Tax Law, any proceeding in court to review an adverse decision must be commenced within 4 months from the date of this notice.

Any inquiries concerning the computation of tax due or refund allowed in accordance with this decision or concerning any other matter relative hereto may be addressed to the undersigned. These will be referred to the proper party for reply.

Very truly yours,

Nigel G. Wright

HEARING OFFICER

Enc.

cc: Petitioner's Representative

Law Bureau

STATE OF NEW YORK

STATE TAX COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition of HARRY S. DUBE and STEPHEN R. CASPER, Individually and as copartners d/b/u the firm name and style of CIRCUS MAGAZINE for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Unincorporated Business : Taxes under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968. In the Matter of the Petition of HARRY S. DUBE for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income Taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968. In the Matter of the Petition of STEPHEN R. and BONNIE F. CASPER for a Redetermination of a Deficiency or for Refund of Personal Income Taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the Year 1968.

CONSOLIDATED DECISION

Harry S. Dube and Stephen R. Casper, individually and as copartners d/b/u the firm name and style of Circus Magazine filed a petition for the redetermination of a deficiency issued under date of February 22, 1971, in the amount of \$2,884.16 plus interest of \$320.57 for a total of \$3,204.73 for unincorporated business taxes under Article 23 of the Tax Law for the year 1968.

Harry S. Dube filed a petition for a refund of \$1,346.87 out of estimated taxes which he had paid in personal income taxes under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the year 1968. Said claim was allowed only to the extent of \$498.68 plus interest of \$46.35 for a total of \$545.03 which has been refunded. The remainder of the claim was denied because of a finding that petitioner's total liability was \$1,601.32 instead of the total liability of \$753.13 shown on his resident and nonresident returns.

Stephen R. and Bonnie F. Casper filed a petition for the redetermination of a Deficiency issued under date of February 22, 1971, in the amount of \$828.29 plus a penalty under section 685(a) of the Tax Law of \$207.22 and interest of \$92.13 for a total of \$1,128.24 for personal income tax under Article 22 of the Tax Law for the year 1968.

A hearing was duly held on September 11, 1972, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, 80 Centre Street, New York, New York, before Nigel G. Wright, Hearing Officer. The petitioners were represented by Charles S.P. Barker, Esq., of Reavis & McGrath and

by Edward H. Eisenstein, C.P.A. The Income Tax Bureau was represented by Saul Heckelman, Esq., appearing by Solomon Sies, Esq., of counsel.

The record of said hearing has been duly examined and considered.

ISSUE

The issue in this case is whether the petitioners' partnership sold assets and realized income to itself or whether the individual partners sold their partnership interests with no income being realized by the partnership.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Circus Magazine of 340 East 64th Street was a partner-ship organized in New York with Mr. Harry S. Dube and Stephen R. Casper as partners.
- 2. Mr. Dube had been in advertising prior to 1941. Since 1941, he has had a contract with the Ringling Brothers Circus (Ringling Bros.-Barnum & Bailey Combined Shows, Inc.) to publish a program for distribution at their shows. This contract extended through the 1971 season.
- 3. Mr. Casper is Mr. Dube's nephew. He became a partner of Mr. Dube in 1966, it being Mr. Dube's desire to retire shortly and aurange for Mr. Casper to take over the entire business. Each one contributed the same amount of cash. Mr. Dube was to receive a small salary after which profits were distributed equally. The partnership was to last until December 31, 1971. Mr. Dube contributed the Ringling Brothers' contract to the partnership with

provision made in the agreement for Mr. Dube's protection in the event of the early termination of the partnership. The Ringling Brothers Circus consented to the partnership.

- 4. In 1967, the Ringling Brothers Circus was sold by the Ringling and North families to a group of investors. The Ringling Brothers Circus then, on January 2, 1968, entered into a contract for the acquisition of Circus Magainze.
- 5. The contract provides that "Dube and Casper hereby sell, and Ringling Bros. hereby purchases, ... their entire partnership interests in Magazine ... ", "Magazine" referring to the "partnership transacting business under the name of the Circus Magazine ... "

 It also provides: "That Dube and Casper are all the partners of Magazine and own all the assets thereof, and have the absolute right to sell, transfer and assign all the assets of Magazine ..."
- 6. The purchase price was \$68,750.00 on the closing date, January 29, 1968, with three deferred payments annually thereafter, each contingent upon Mr. Dube's survival, of \$75,721.15, \$69,444.44 and \$62,500.00 each with interest of 4% a year from the date of the contract. In addition, Ringling Brothers Circus paid an amount to relaburse Mr. Dube and Mr. Casper for the costs already incurred of publishing for the 1968 season.
- 7. Mr. Dube changed his residence from New York to Florida on December 8, 1968. Mr. Casper was a nonresident of New York during 1968 and thereafter.

274 g = -

- 8. Each partner reported on his Federal income tax return the sale of a partnership interest each showing a cost basis of zero and reporting one-half of the total consideration but computing tax on only his one-half share of the amount received in 1968 \$34,375.00.
- 9. Circus Magazine filed a New York partnership return for 1968 showing only certain small expenses and reporting a loss.

 The return was marked "final return".
- 10. Mr. Dube filed a timely New York resident return and later, an amended resident return and a nonresident return. He reported the sale of his partnership interest on his resident return.
 - 11. Mr. Casper did not file a New York return for 1968.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

A. The petitioner, doing business as Circus Magazine, clearly sold the assets of the business either directly or in liquidation of the business under section 703(a) of the Tax Law, and the gain thereon is subject to tax under Article 23 of the Tax Law.

B. The deficiency is sustained and each and every petition is decided.

The refund claimed by Mr. Dube is granted.

DARTO: Albany, New York

January 29, 1975

STATE TAX COMMISSION

PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

Department of Taxation and Finance STATE OF NEW YORK AD 32 (6-73) 250M

ALBANY, N. Y. 12227 STATE CAMPUS

We such number

9660-98-850

Moved, not forwardable

Mr. & Mrs. Stephen R. Casper 5509 Belmont Avenue Cincinnati, Ohio

> CERTIFIED No. 202107

MAIL